

## ORAL ARGUMENT NOT YET SCHEDULED

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

UNION OF CONCERNED	)	
SCIENTISTS, et al.,	)	
	)	
Petitioners,	)	
	)	
v.	)	Case No. 19-1230 &
	)	Consolidated Cases
NATIONAL HIGHWAY TRAFFIC	)	
SAFETY ADMINISTRATION, et al.,	)	
	)	
Respondents.	)	
	)	

**INTERVENOR STATES' RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO  
RESPONDENT'S MOTION TO HOLD CASE IN ABEYANCE**

The Intervenor States oppose the request to hold this case in abeyance. The federal government asks for this case to be held in abeyance so that it may have time to decide whether to change course. Relevant here, holding the case in abeyance will give the federal government time to decide whether to grant California a waiver under Section 209(b)(1) of the Clean Air Act. But the federal government's consideration of whether to grant a waiver is a reason to *expedite* the resolution of this case—it is not a reason to refrain from deciding it.

To see why, recall that this case presents the question whether the Constitution forbids the federal government from granting a waiver under Section 209(b)(1). The answer to that question is “yes,” because Section 209(b)(1) is unconstitutional. Section 209(b)(1) violates the equal-sovereignty doctrine by “allowing California to retain [a] piece of its sovereign authority” —the power to set emissions standards for new vehicles—that the Clean Air Act “strips from every other State.” Br. of Intervenor States at 8, Doc. #1862459 (D.C. Cir., Sept. 21, 2020). If nothing else, it is an open and serious question whether Section 209(b)(1) is constitutional. It would behoove all the parties to know the answer to that question before, not after, the federal government considers again whether to grant California a waiver under Section 209(b)(1).

This Court has previously “decline[d] to exercise” its “discretion” to hold in abeyance a case presenting a legal question that would necessarily inform an agency’s consideration of “potential regulatory changes.” *Util. Solid Waste Activities Grp. v. EPA*, 901 F.3d 414, 426 (D.C. Cir. 2018) (*per curiam*). It should do the same here. That is especially so because the Court can provide the parties with an answer to the equal-sovereignty issue without straining the litigants’ resources. There is little left to be done at this stage of the case, which has been “fully briefed” for months. *See Zamora-Mallari v. Mukasey*, 514 F.3d 679, 682 (7th Cir. 2008); *cf. Lead Indus. Ass’n*

*v. EPA*, 647 F.2d 1184, 1186 (D.C. Cir. 1980) (denying motion to hold case in abeyance filed after oral argument). The Court can, if it wishes, schedule argument at the next available opportunity and quickly issue a decision. And if the Court were to accept the Intervenor States' equal-sovereignty argument, a decision in this case would spare all the parties the many resources that would otherwise be wasted considering whether to issue an unconstitutional waiver to California.

In sum, the parties have fully briefed this case, which presents a critically important question of constitutional law that will inform the very act—the granting of a waiver to California—that the federal government seeks abeyance in order to consider. The Intervenor States respectfully ask the Court to deny the motion and to decide this case.

Dated: February 3, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

DAVE YOST  
Attorney General of Ohio

/s/ Benjamin M. Flowers  
BENJAMIN M. FLOWERS  
Ohio Solicitor General  
AARON FARMER  
Assistant Attorney General  
30 East Broad Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
614-466-8980  
614-466-5087 fax  
bflowers@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
*Counsel for State of Ohio*

STEVE MARSHALL  
Attorney General of Alabama

LESLIE RUTLEDGE  
Attorney General of Arkansas

/s/ Edmund G. LaCour Jr. (BMF per authority)  
EDMUND G. LACOUR JR.  
Alabama Solicitor General  
Office of the Attorney General  
501 Washington Ave.  
Montgomery, Alabama 36130  
(334) 353-2196  
edmund.lacour@alabamaag.gov  
*Counsel for State of Alabama*

/s/ Nicholas J. Bronni (BMF per authority)  
NICHOLAS J. BRONNI  
Arkansas Solicitor General  
VINCENT WAGNER  
Deputy Solicitor General  
323 Center Street, Suite 200  
Little Rock, Arkansas 72201  
(501) 682-6302  
nicholas.bronni@arkansasag.gov  
*Counsel for State of Arkansas*

CHRISTOPHER M. CARR  
Attorney General of Georgia

/s/ Andrew A. Pinson (BMF per authority)

ANDREW A. PINSON  
Georgia Solicitor General  
Office of the Georgia Attorney General  
40 Capitol Square SW  
Atlanta, Georgia 30334  
(404) 458-3409  
apinson@law.ga.gov  
*Counsel for State of Georgia*

THEODORE E. ROKITA  
Attorney General of Indiana

/s/ Thomas M. Fisher (BMF per authority)

THOMAS M. FISHER  
Indiana Solicitor General  
Office of the Attorney General  
302 West Washington Street  
IGCS-5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Indianapolis, IN 46204  
(317) 233-8292  
katherine.jacob@atg.in.gov  
*Counsel for State of Indiana*

JEFF LANDRY  
Attorney General of Louisiana

/s/ Elizabeth B. Murrill (BMF per authority)

ELIZABETH B. MURRILL  
Louisiana Solicitor General  
LOUISIANA DEPARTMENT  
OF JUSTICE  
1885 N. 3rd St.  
Baton Rouge, LA 70802  
(225) 326-6766  
MurrillE@ag.louisiana.gov  
*Counsel for State of Louisiana*

ERIC S. SCHMITT  
Attorney General of Missouri

/s/ John Sauer (BMF per authority)

D. JOHN SAUER  
Missouri Solicitor General  
207 W. High St.  
P.O. Box 899  
Jefferson City, MO 65102  
(573) 751-3321  
john.sauer@ago.mo.gov  
*Counsel for State of Missouri*

DOUGLAS J. PETERSON  
Attorney General of Nebraska

/s/ Justin D. Lavene (BMF per authority)

JUSTIN D. LAVENE  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
2115 State Capitol  
Lincoln, Nebraska 68509  
(402) 471-2834  
justin.lavene@nebraska.gov  
*Counsel for State of Nebraska*

ALAN WILSON  
Attorney General of South Carolina

/s/ James Emory Smith, Jr. (BMF per authority)

JAMES EMORY SMITH, JR.  
South Carolina Deputy Solicitor General  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, S.C. 29211  
(803) 734-3642  
esmith@scag.gov  
*Counsel for State of South Carolina*

KEN PAXTON  
Attorney General of Texas

BRENT WEBSTER  
First Assistant Attorney General  
/s/ Judd E. Stone II (BMF per authority)  
JUDD E. STONE II  
Texas Solicitor General  
Office of the Attorney General  
P.O. Box 12548 (MC 059)  
Austin, Texas 78711-2548  
(512) 936-1700  
Judd.Stone@oag.texas.gov  
*Counsel for State of Texas*

SEAN D. REYES  
Attorney General of Utah

/s/ Melissa A. Holyoak (BMF per authority)  
MELISSA A. HOLYOAK  
Utah Solicitor General  
160 East 300 South, 5th Floor  
Salt Lake City, Utah 84114  
(385) 271-2484  
melissaholyoak@agutah.gov  
*Counsel for State of Utah*

PATRICK MORRISEY  
Attorney General of West Virginia

/s/ Lindsay S. See (BMF per authority)

LINDSAY S. SEE

West Virginia Solicitor General  
OFFICE OF THE WEST VIRGINIA  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

State Capitol Complex

Building 1, Room E-26

Charleston, WV 25305

(304) 558-2021

[lindsay.s.see@wvago.gov](mailto:lindsay.s.see@wvago.gov)

*Counsel for State of West Virginia*

## CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

Pursuant to Fed R. App. P. 32 (f) and (g), I hereby certify that the foregoing response complies with the limitation of Fed. R. App. P. 27(d)(2)(A) and Circuit Rule 27(a)(2) because it contains 470 words, excluding exempted portions, according to the count of Microsoft Word.

I further certify that the motion complies with Fed. R. App. P. 27(d)(1)(E), 32(a)(5) and (6) because it has been prepared in 14-point Equity Font.

/s/ Benjamin M. Flowers  
BENJAMIN M. FLOWERS  
*Counsel for State of Ohio*



**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on February 3, 2020, I caused the foregoing motion to be electrically filed with the Clerk of the Court by using the Court's CM/ECF system. All registered counsel will be served by the Court's CM/ECF system. I further certify that a copy of the foregoing has been served via United States First Class Mail upon the following:

William F. Cooper  
State of Hawaii  
Department of the Attorney General  
425 Queen Street  
Honolulu, HI 96813

/s/ Benjamin M. Flowers  
BENJAMIN M. FLOWERS  
*Counsel for State of Ohio*