| 1 | MARK BRNOVICH | | | | | |
|------|------------------------------------|------------------|--|--|--|--|
| 2 | ATTORNEY GENERAL | | | | | |
| | (Firm State Bar No. 14000) | | | | | |
| 3 | ALYSE C. MEISLIK (BAR NO. 024052) | | | | | |
| 4 | ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL | | | | | |
| _ | OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL | | | | | |
| 5 | 2005 North Central Avenue | | | | | |
| 6 | Phoenix, AZ 85004-1592 | | | | | |
| 7 | Telephone: (602) 542-7727 | | | | | |
| | Facsimile: (602) 542-4377 | | | | | |
| 8 | Email: consumer@azag.gov | | | | | |
| 9 | Attorneys for the State of Arizona | | | | | |
| | | AT OF A PAROMA | | | | |
| 10 | SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA | | | | | |
| 11 | IN MARICOPA COUNTY | | | | | |
| 12 | STATE OF ARIZONA, ex rel. MARK | Case No.: | | | | |
| 13 | BRNOVICH, Attorney General, | CONSENT JUDGMENT | | | | |
| 14 | Plaintiff, | | | | | |
| 15 | v. | | | | | |
| 16 | FORD MOTOR COMPANY | | | | | |
| 17 | FORD MOTOR COMPANY, | | | | | |
| | Defendant. | | | | | |
| 18 l | | | | | | |

The State of Arizona, *ex rel*. Mark Brnovich, the Attorney General (the "Attorney General"), filed a Complaint alleging violations of the Arizona Consumer Fraud Act, A.R.S. §§ 44-1521 to -1534 (the "CFA"), and the defendant Ford Motor Company ("Ford") has waived service of the Complaint, has been advised of the right to a trial in this matter, and has waived the same. Ford admits the jurisdiction of this Court over the subject matter and parties, stipulates that this Court may enter this Consent Judgment, and acknowledges that this Court will retain jurisdiction for the purpose of enforcing this Consent Judgment. Ford has consented and stipulated to entry of this Consent Judgment to compromise and settle claims in connection with an investigation under the Arizona Consumer Fraud Act and not out of any admission of guilt, wrongdoing, violation, or sanction.

PARTIES

- 1. The Attorney General is authorized to bring this action under the CFA.
- 2. Ford is an automobile manufacturer that is incorporated in Delaware and has its principal place of business in Dearborn, Michigan.
- 3. All events, acts and practices described in, and relevant to, this Consent Judgment took place throughout Arizona.
- 4. This Court has jurisdiction over the Complaint and the parties necessary for the Court to enter this Consent Judgment and any orders hereafter appropriate pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1528 and this Consent Judgment.
 - 5. Venue is proper in Maricopa County pursuant to A.R.S. § 12-401.

NO ADMISSION OF LIABILITY

6. The parties have entered into this Consent Judgment without trial of any issue of fact or law. Ford specifically denies it has violated any federal or state laws. Nothing contained herein may be taken as or construed to be an admission or concession of any violation of law or regulation, or of any other matter of fact or law, or of any liability or wrongdoing, nor shall it constitute any evidence or finding supporting any of the allegations of fact or law alleged by the Attorney General, or any violation of state or federal law, rule or regulation or any liability or wrongdoing whatsoever. This Consent Judgment is not intended to constitute evidence or precedent of any kind except in any action or proceeding by one of the parties to enforce, rescind or otherwise implement or affirm any or all terms of this Consent Judgment. The parties expressly acknowledge and agree that nothing shall prevent the Attorneys General's enforcement rights associated with this Consent Judgment.

DEFINITIONS

- 7. The following terms used herein shall have the following meanings:
 - a. "Covered Conduct" shall mean Ford's advertising claims of: (1) fuel economy relating to C-MAX vehicles from Model Years ("MY") 2013–2014; and (2) maximum payload capacity of MY 2011–2015 Ford vehicles.

- b. "Ford" shall mean Ford Motor Company and its Subsidiaries, successors and assigns.
- c. "Fuel Economy" shall mean the EPA-estimated fuel economy rating used or calculated by Ford in compliance with the regulations, rules and laws proscribed by United States Environmental Protection Agency.
- d. "Multistate Executive Committee" or "MSEC" shall mean the Attorneys General of Arizona, Illinois, Maryland, Oregon, Texas and Vermont.
- e. "Multistate Working Group" or "MSWG" shall mean the Attorneys General of Alabama, Arizona, Arkansas, California, Colorado, Connecticut, District of Columbia, Florida, Illinois, Indiana, Iowa, Georgia, Kansas, Kentucky, Louisiana, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, Minnesota, Missouri, Nebraska, Nevada, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, North Carolina, North Dakota, Ohio, Oklahoma, Oregon, Pennsylvania, Rhode Island, Tennessee, Texas, Utah, Vermont, Virginia, Washington, West Virginia, and Wisconsin.
- f. "Payload Capacity" shall mean the combined maximum weight of cargo and passengers that the vehicle is designed to carry.
- g. "Subsidiaries" shall mean any corporation, association, joint venture, partnership, limited liability company or other business entity of which at least a majority of the Voting Stock is, at the point in time when the violation of this Consent Judgment is alleged to have taken place, owned directly or indirectly by Ford Motor Company. Voting Stock means the capital stock or equivalent interests, if the entity does not have capital stock, having the right to vote for the election of directors or equivalent persons, if such entity does not have directors, of any corporation, association, joint venture, partnership, limited liability company or other business entity.

ALLEGATIONS OF FACT

8. The Attorney General has made allegations that some of Ford's advertisements relating to estimated Fuel Economy and Payload Capacity for new motor vehicles constituted

deceptive and/or unfair acts and practices in violation of the CFA. Ford denies such allegations.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 9. The Attorney General alleges that Ford violated the CFA by engaging in or directing others to engage in the actions described in paragraph 8 above. Ford denies such allegations.
- 10. The Attorney General alleges that pursuant to the CFA, Ford's violations entitle the Attorney General to relief necessary to prevent the unlawful acts and practices described in this Consent Judgment and to remedy the consequences of past unlawful practices. Ford denies such allegations.

ORDER

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

- 11. The injunctive relief set forth in this Consent Judgment is binding upon any of the following that receive actual notice of this Consent Judgment through personal service or otherwise: (a) Ford and its subsidiaries; and (b) its officers, servants, employees, and attorneys.
- 12. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1528, Ford is enjoined, restrained, and prohibited as follows:
 - a. Ford shall not make false or misleading advertising claims concerning the estimated Fuel Economy of a new motor vehicle in violation of the CFA, A.R.S. §§ 44-1521 to 44-1534.
 - b. Ford shall not make false or misleading advertising claims concerning the Payload Capacity of a new motor vehicle in violation of the CFA, A.R.S. §§ 44-1521 to 44-1534.

PAYMENT TO THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

13. Ford shall pay the MSWG Attorneys General a total of \$19,000,000, plus costs of \$200,000, to be divided and paid by Ford directly to each Attorney General of the MSWG in an amount to be designated in writing by and in the sole discretion of the MSEC. Payment shall be

1 | n 2 | fr 3 | ir 4 | b 5 | ir

678

9

10

11 12

13

15

14

16

17

1819

2021

22

2324

25

26

27

28

; || . .

made by Ford within 30 calendar days of receiving written payment processing instructions from the MSEC. Said payment shall be used by the Attorneys General for any lawful purpose including consumer protection enforcement or consumer education, or for other uses permitted by state law, at the sole discretion of each Attorney General. Unless otherwise required by law, in no event shall any portion of this payment be characterized as a fine, civil penalty or forfeiture by Ford to any participating Attorney General's Office.

- 14. Pursuant to the amount designated by the MSEC, and as part of the payment described in paragraph 13, Ford shall pay the Attorney General \$884,364.40 by wire transfer, which will be used by the Attorney General as follows:
 - a. \$200,000 will be used for attorneys' fees and costs, pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1534, and will be deposited by the Attorney General into the Consumer Protection-Consumer Fraud Revolving Fund pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1531.01, and used for the purposes specified in A.R.S. § 44-1531.01; and
 - b. \$684,364.40 will be deposited by the Attorney General into the Consumer Protection-Consumer Fraud Revolving Fund pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1531.01, and used for the purposes specified in A.R.S. § 44-1531.01.

RELEASE

15. By execution of this Consent Judgment, and following a full and complete payment to the Attorney General of the amount required under paragraph 14, the Attorney General terminates its investigation of the Covered Conduct and releases and discharges, to the fullest extent permitted by law, Ford from any and all civil causes of action, claims, damages, costs, attorney's fees, or penalties the Attorney General has asserted or could have asserted under the CFA, as of the Effective Date, against Ford by reason of the Covered Conduct (collectively, the "Released Claims").

• • •

- 16. Notwithstanding this Consent Judgment, the following do not comprise Released Claims:
 - a. Private rights of action, including any claims consumers have or may have on an individual or class basis under state consumer protection laws against any person or entity, including Ford;
 - b. Claims of environmental or tax liability;
 - c. Criminal liability;
 - d. Claims for property damage;
 - e. Claims alleging violations of state or federal securities laws;
 - f. Claims alleging violations of state or federal antitrust laws;
 - g. Any claims against Ford by any other agency or subdivision of the State of Arizona; and
 - h. Any obligations created under this Consent Judgment.

ENFORCEMENT NOTICE

- 17. Prior to the Attorney General instituting a court proceeding based solely on an alleged violation of this Consent Judgment, the parties agree that the Attorney General will provide Ford with written notice if the Attorney General believes that Ford is in violation of any of its obligations under this Consent Judgment, including a specific description of the conduct that appears to violate the Consent Judgment and the provisions of the Consent Judgment that the conduct appears to violate, and provide Ford thirty (30) business days after the date of receipt of the notice prior to commencing any further proceeding; provided, however, that the Attorney General may take any action where the Attorney General concludes that because of the specific practice, a threat to the health or safety of the public requires immediate action.
- 18. Within thirty (30) business days of receipt of the Notice, Ford shall have the opportunity to demonstrate that:
 - a. Ford is in compliance with the obligations of this Consent Judgment cited by the Attorney General as being violated;

- b. the alleged violation has been addressed, including by remedial actions having been taken to remedy any conduct inconsistent with this Consent Judgment; or
- c. Ford has begun to take action to address the alleged violation, is pursuing such action with due diligence, and has provided a reasonable timetable for addressing the alleged violation.
- 19. Nothing shall prevent the Attorney General from agreeing to provide Ford with additional time beyond the thirty (30) business days to respond to the Notice.

NOTICES

20. Any notices required to be sent to the Attorney General or to Ford by this Consent Judgment shall be sent by certified mail and electronic mail to the following addresses:

| For Ford Motor Company: | For the Arizona Attorney General: |
|-------------------------|---|
| notice@ford.com | Alyse.Meislik@azag.gov |
| | consumer@azag.gov |
| Ford Motor Company | |
| One American Road | Arizona Attorney General's Office |
| Dearborn, MI 48216 | Attn: Alyse Meislik, Assistant Attorney General |
| | Consumer Protection & Advocacy Section |
| | 2005 N. Central Ave. |
| | Phoenix, AZ 85004 |

MISCELLANEOUS

- 21. The parties acknowledge that no other promises, representations or agreements of any nature have been made or entered into by the parties. The parties further acknowledge that this Consent Judgment constitutes a single and entire agreement that is not severable or divisible, except that if any provision herein is found to be legally insufficient or unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall continue in full force and effect.
- 22. If subsequent to the Effective Date of this Consent Judgment, the federal government or Arizona enacts or promulgates any law or regulation with respect to matters governed by this Consent Judgment that creates a conflict with any provision of the Consent Judgment, Ford shall notify the Attorney General of the alleged conflict, stating with specificity the provision of this Consent Judgment it believes conflicts with the newly enacted law or

28 || .

regulation. Attorney General shall respond to Ford's notification of the alleged conflict within thirty (30) days. In the interim, Ford shall continue to comply with the terms of this Consent Judgment to the extent possible. Factors to be considered in determining whether a conflict exists is whether conduct prohibited by this Consent Judgment is required by such federal or state law or regulation, or conduct required by this Consent Judgment is prohibited by such federal or state law or regulation.

- 23. Ford and Ford's attorney agree and understand that following the execution of this Consent Judgment, the Attorney General may communicate directly with Ford for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this agreement, resolving future complaints, and conducting undercover investigations of Ford to the extent permitted by law.
- 24. Ford understands that, in addition to any other sanctions which may be imposed under this Consent Judgment, the Attorney General reserves all statutory and legal remedies for violation of the terms of this Consent Judgment pursuant to the CFA.
- 25. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as relieving Ford of its obligations to comply with all state, local, and federal laws, regulations or rules, or as granting permission to engage in any acts or practices prohibited by such law, regulation or rule.
- 26. Neither this Consent Judgment nor anything herein shall be construed or used as a waiver, limitation or bar on any defense otherwise available to Ford, or on Ford's right to defend itself from or make arguments in any pending or future legal or administrative action, proceeding, local or federal claim or suit, including without limitation, private individual or class action claims or suits, relating to Ford's conduct prior to the execution of this Consent Judgment, or to the existence, subject matter or terms of this Consent Judgment.
- 27. Each party has cooperated in (and in any construction to be made of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed to have cooperated in) the drafting and the preparation of this Consent Judgment. Any rule of construction to the effect that any ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting party shall not be employed in any interpretation of this Consent Judgment.

28 || .

- 28. If any provision of this Consent Judgment is held by a court of competent jurisdiction to be invalid, void or unenforceable, the remainder of the provisions shall remain in full force and effect and shall in no way be affected, impaired, or invalidated.
- 29. This Consent Judgment may be executed by the parties in counterparts and be delivered by facsimile or electronic transmission, or a copy thereof, such constituting an original counterpart hereof, all of which together will constitute one and the same document.
- 30. The parties understand and agree that this Consent Judgment shall not be construed as an approval or sanction by the Attorney General of Ford's business practices, nor shall Ford represent that this Consent Judgment constitutes an approval or sanction of its business practices. The Parties further understand and agree that any failure by the Attorney General to take any action in response to any information submitted pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall not be construed as an approval, waiver, or sanction of any representations, acts, or practices indicated by such information, nor shall it preclude action thereon at a later date, except as provided by the Release set forth in paragraphs 18–19 of this Consent Judgment.
- 31. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed to waive, limit, or expand any claims of sovereign immunity the Attorney General may have in any action or proceeding.
- 32. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed to create, waive, limit or expand any private right of action.
 - 33. No court costs or disbursements shall be taxed to any party.
- 34. Jurisdiction is retained by this Court for the purpose of entertaining an application by the Attorney General for the enforcement of this Consent Judgment.
- 35. This Consent Judgment is the result of a compromise between the parties. Only the Attorney General may seek enforcement of this Consent Judgment. Nothing herein is intended to create a private right of action by other parties.
- 36. The effective date of this Consent Judgment is the date that it is entered by the court.

| 1 | 37. This Co | onsent Judgment res | olves all outstanding claims expressly identified in the | | |
|--|--|---------------------|--|--|--|
| 2 | Complaint as to Ford. As no further matters remain pending, this is a final judgment entered | | | | |
| 3 | pursuant to Ariz. R. C | Civ. P. 54(c). | | | |
| 4 | DATED this _ | day of | , 2022. | | |
| 5 | | | | | |
| 6 | | | | | |
| 7 | | | | | |
| 8 | | | JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT | | |
| 9 | | | | | |
| 10 | | | | | |
| 11 | | | | | |
| 12 | | | | | |
| 13 | | | | | |
| 14 | | | | | |
| 15 | | | | | |
| 16 | | | | | |
| 17 | | | | | |
| 18 | | | | | |
| 19 | | | | | |
| 20 | | | | | |
| 21 | | | | | |
| 22 23 | | | | | |
| 23 24 | | | | | |
| 24 25 | | | | | |
| 25 26 | | | | | |
| 20 27 | | | | | |
| $\begin{bmatrix} 27 \\ 28 \end{bmatrix}$ | | | | | |
| | | | | | |

CONSENT TO JUDGMENT

- 1. Ford acknowledges that it waived service of the Summons and Complaint and is aware of its right to a trial in this matter and has waived the same.
- 2. Ford admits the jurisdiction of this Court and consents to the entry of the foregoing Allegations of Fact and Conclusions of Law and Order.
- 3. Ford states that no promise of any kind or nature whatsoever was made to induce it to enter into this Consent Judgment and declares that it has entered into this Consent Judgment voluntarily.
- 4. This Consent Judgment is entered as a result of a compromise between the parties. Only the Attorney General may seek enforcement of this Consent Judgment. Nothing herein is intended to create a private right of action by other parties; however, this Consent Judgment does not limit the rights of any private party to pursue any remedies allowed by law.
- 5. Ford acknowledges that its acceptance of this Consent Judgment is for the purpose of settling the ongoing consumer fraud lawsuit filed by the Attorney General, and further acknowledges that this Consent Judgment does not preclude any agency or officer of this State or subdivision thereof from instituting other civil or criminal proceedings as may be appropriate.
- 6. This Consent to Judgment may be executed in counterparts and be delivered by facsimile or electronic transmission, or a copy thereof, such constituting an original counterpart hereof, all of which together will constitute one and the same document.

21 ||...

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22 || . . .

23 || . . .

24 ||...

25 ||...

26 || . .

27 || . .

., 11 , ,

28 || . .

| 1 | 7. Ford represents and warrants that the person signing below on its behalf | is duly | | |
|----|--|---------|--|--|
| 2 | appointed and authorized to do so. | | | |
| 3 | Executed on May 18, 2022 | | | |
| 4 | Ford Motor Company | | | |
| 5 | | | | |
| 6 | | | | |
| 7 | Signature: () 12 La La | | | |
| 8 | Name: <u>Thomas Falahee</u> Title: Assistant General Counsel | | | |
| 9 | | | | |
| 10 | | | | |
| 11 | APPROVED AS TO FORM AND CONTENT: | | | |
| 12 | MARK BRNOVICH Ford Motor Company Attorney General | | | |
| 13 | | | | |
| 14 | 111 | | | |
| 15 | By: Olype Meislik By: Com at Ith | | | |
| 16 | Alyse C. Meislik Thomas Falahee | | | |
| 17 | Assistant Attorney General Assistant General Counsel Attorneys for State of Arizona Attorney for Ford Motor Comp | nanv | | |
| 18 | | , and | | |
| 19 | | | | |
| 20 | | | | |
| 21 | | | | |
| 22 | | | | |
| 23 | | | | |
| 24 | | | | |
| 25 | | | | |
| 26 | | | | |
| 27 | | | | |
| 28 | | | | |